INVESTIGATION OF TRANSNATIONAL ORGANIZED CRIME. TECHNIQUES AND METHODS FOR IDENTIFYING AND SEIZURE OF THE PROCEEDS

By Petre Buneci1, Nicolae Grofu2 and Bogdan Buneci3

Abstract
Transnational threats and modes of operation in the further evolution of organized criminal groups lead to the intensification of the fight against organized crime both by national authorities and at the level of the European Union. In addition to the legal normative acts necessary for this purpose, it was concluded that cooperation in the investigation of transnational organized crime must be boosted, especially through the exchange of information without obstacles and timely access to information, as well as through the investigative techniques, especially the search, leads and evidence submitted as part of necessary communications, investigations and prosecutions for the purpose of law enforcement adapted to the digital world.

Keywords: organized crime, anti-corruption, transnational offences, special seizure, special investigative techniques

In order to improve the common capacities of the European Union and the Member States in order to combat transnational organized crime, international cooperation between the countries of the union is necessary, as well as harmonization of criminal law with a view to the annihilation of transnational criminal networks.

1. International legal framework for preventing and combating transnational organized crime
Transnational criminal activities have led to the development of international documents, so that the United Nations Resolution 55/25 of 15 November 2000 was drafted the United Nations Convention against Transnational organized crime4, being the main international instrument in promoting cooperation, prevention and combating transnational organized crime more effectively. Subsequently, three protocols have emerged to this Convention covering specific areas and manifestations of organized crime, and here we would call the Protocol on preventing, suppressing and punishing trafficking in human beings, in particular women and children, the Protocol against the smuggling of migrants by land, air and sea, The Protocol against the illicit manufacture and trafficking of firearms, their parts and components and ammunition.
Both the United Nations Convention against Transnational organized crime and the Council of Europe Framework Decision 2008/841/JHA on the fight against organized crime show what is meant by organized criminal group5, serious crime6, structured group, blocking or seizure of movement of goods7 and confiscation8. Moreover, the United Nations Convention against transnational organized crime sets out the situations in which states must adopt legislative

---

1 University Professor PhD, Faculty of Law, Ecological University of Bucharest, vice president of the Romanian National Group affiliated to AIDP; bunpetre56@yahoo.com;
2 Associate Professor PhD, Police Academy, Bucharest, vice president of the Romanian National Group affiliated to AIDP, nicu.grofu@gmail.com.
3 Associate Professor PhD, Faculty of Law, Ecological University of Bucharest, bogdanbuneci@yahoo.ro;
4 Published in the Official Gazette of Romania, Part I, no. 813 of November 8, 2002.
5 The term organized criminal group designates a structured group of three or more persons, which has existed for a certain period and acts in agreement, for the purpose of committing one or more serious offenses or offenses under this Convention, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial advantage or other material advantage.
6 Serious crime expression means an act which constitutes an offence punishable by a custodial sentence of which the maximum must not be less than 4 years or a more sentence heavy.
7 Blocking or seizure terms refer to the temporary ban on transfer, conversion, the provision or movement of goods or the fact of temporarily taking over security or control of goods on the basis of a decision of a court or other competent authority.
8 Term confiscation means permanent dispossession of property, based on the decision of a court or other competent authority.
measures regarding the criminalization of participation in an organized criminal group; criminalization of money laundering\textsuperscript{9}; anti-money laundering measures; criminalization of corruption; confiscation and seizure; international cooperation for the purpose of confiscation; the disposal of the proceeds of the crime or confiscated property and other aspects necessary for the investigation of transnational organized crime.

The most serious forms of organized crime have a transnational dimension either because they relate to acts committed in different countries or by authors who benefit from contacts and support abroad, either because capital laundering goes through foreign countries in the form of investments in companies or real estate abroad, or through the use of tax havens to hide the products of crime. The numerous instruments have already been adopted on an international and European scale to remedy organized crime (and the crimes associated with it) and, as a result, its arising from its essential transnational dimension, adopting a number of documents in this regard\textsuperscript{10}.

Following the request of 16 EU countries, including Romania, The Council of the European Union adopted Council Regulation (EU) 2017/1939 of 12 October 2017 on\textsuperscript{11} the establishment\textsuperscript{12} of the European Public Prosecutor’s Office (EPPO) in order to give equivalent protection to the financial interests of the European Union by establishing that effect the organizational structure and internal decision-making process of the EPPO. That institution shall have the power to investigate, prosecute and prosecute perpetrators of offenses affecting the financial interests of the Union (as provided for in Directive (EU) 2017/1371 and laid down in this Regulation) and their accomplices. To this end, the EPPO shall conduct investigations, prosecute and exercise public action in the competent courts of the Member States, pending the completion of the case.

In order to recover and confiscate the assets obtained by committing transnational offence, Directive 2022/0167 on the recovery and confiscation of assets is in the process of being adopted. Following the adoption of the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, Romania adopted legislative measures within the meaning of the provisions of the Convention, as follows:

- the criminalization of the criminal group organized in the provisions of art. 367 of the Romanian Criminal Code regarding the establishment of an organized criminal group and art. 35 of Law no. 535/2004 on the prevention and combating of terrorism;
- Law no. 78/2000 for the prevention, discovery and sanctioning of acts of corruption;
- Law no. 129/2019 for preventing and combating money laundering and terrorist financing-criminal liability of the legal person art. 135 – 145 Criminal code;

\textsuperscript{9} Article 6 para. 1:
- change or transfer of goods that the perpetrator knows are the product of the crime, in order to conceal or disguise the illicit origin of those goods or to assist any person involved in the commission of the main offense to evade the legal consequences of his acts;
- concealment or disguise of true nature, origin, location, arrangement, the change or ownership of goods or other rights relating thereto the perpetrator of which he knows are the product of the offence;
- the purchase, possession or use of goods that the person who purchases them owns or uses knows, at the time he receives them, that they are the product of the crime;
- participation in one of the offences provided for or in any other association, understanding, attempt or complicity by providing assistance, assistance or advice for its commission.


\textsuperscript{11} UE Regulation 2017/1939 of the Counsel from 12th October 2017

\textsuperscript{12} The European Prosecutor’s Office (EPPO)
- legal provisions regarding the special confiscation and the extended confiscation provided in the provisions of art. 112 – 1121 of the Criminal Code as well as seizure;
- the precautionary measures – the seizure procedure provided in the provisions of art. 249-252 Code of criminal procedure.

2. Investigating transnational organized crime

As transnational organized crime is one of the main threats to international security and can cause significant economic social damage, a number of crime priorities have been set at EU level for the period 2022 – 2025, such as:
- high-risk criminal networks in view of the intensification of the dismemberment of organized crime structures on corruption, acts of violence, firearms, money laundering; As proposed in the Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament on the EU Strategy for Combating Organized Crime 2021 – 2025, it must be set up in the law enforcement system of all Member States or have national structures or bodies specializing in mafia-type organizations which can give as an example Romania, where there is the Directorate for the Investigation of Organized Crime and Terrorism. Cooperation against these criminal groups is also carried out through the 16 Member States participating in the @ON network, which has existed since 2014 and where the secondment of specialized investigators on the ground in all Member States is facilitated in order to contribute to the investigation of organized transnational criminal groups. The @ON network should be strengthened by including all Member States and developing good practices, as well as by a closer link with EMPACT in its work against criminal networks.
- cyberattacks and cybercrime are growing and are getting more sophisticated and measures to combat cybercrime need to be strengthened, especially by those who offer specialized criminal services online. Cyberattacks such as the creation and dissemination of malware, piracy must be countered in order to steal sensitive personal or industrial data, or attacks aimed at blocking their access.
- trafficking of human beings in which not only are the fundamental rights of people violated, but also sexual exploitation which is the most widespread form of trafficking in the European Union. Here organized criminal groups are increasingly recruiting their victims online, falsifying identity documents and work permits and exploiting them for sexual purposes, for forced labour, forced crime or begging.
- sexual exploitation of children – the existence of online child sexual abuse and online exploitation of children has steadily increased, thus, the 2011 Directive on combating child sexual abuse, sexual exploitation of children and child pornography needs to be applied more. Thus, in May 2022 the European Commission stated that clear rules are needed to effectively combat the misuse of online services for the purpose of child sexual abuse, providing solid conditions and guarantees. Under the proposed rules, suppliers will be required to detect, report and remove child sexual abuse materials from their services. Europol also supported the expansion of its campaign ‘Trace an Object’, providing the public with information on individual objects in images of sexual abuse of children that may contribute to the restriction of the geographical location of an abuse and therefore, can help identify and save victims.
- illegal introduction of migrants; Migrant trafficking remains a major activity of organized criminal groups that endangers migrants and affects the EU’s migration management objectives. For this reason, the networks involved in these types of crimes must be investigated and combated, in order to support cooperation in the field of law enforcement, as well as to boost cooperation with third countries.
- anti-corruption measures must be assessed and updated in the light of developments in international practices as forms of corruption related to organized crime in a transnational context justify the need to improve the exchange of expertise, good practice, data and information between Member States and with civil society. Corruption by EU citizens and businesses in partner countries must also be criminalized and prosecuted in accordance with the obligations set out in the OECD Convention on Combating the Bribery of Civil Functionaries in international commercial transactions. In Romania, in addition to the offenses of bribery and influence peddling
provided by art. 289 and art. 291 Criminal code, the crime within art. 294 Criminal code relating to acts committed by or in connection with foreign officials.

- drug trafficking is one of the main sources of income for transnational organized criminal groups, so more stringent measures are needed to control certain substances, including precursors, chemicals and solvents that are used in the manufacture of narcotic drugs and psychotropic substances and whose availability has led to an increase in the clandestine manufacture of these drugs and substances. Drug trafficking remains a major source of income for organized criminal groups, and the EU has set priorities for the next 5 years in the EU Drugs Strategy 2021 – 2025 which was adopted in the Council in December 2020.

- economic and financial fraud offenses including online fraud systems, fraud with excisable products, intra-Community fraud with phantom companies, intellectual property offenses, counterfeiting of goods and counterfeiting of coins, funds from crime and money laundering. In addition to Europol and Eurojust’s work in this area, EPPO has investigated and prosecuted for crimes related to participation in a criminal organization, whether the criminal activity of the organization is aimed at committing offenses affecting the Union budget, including serious transnational VAT fraud. Thus, as investigative measures and other EPPO measures we have the search of any headquarters, land, means of transport, private housing, personal goods or computer systems; obtaining any relevant object or document, obtaining stored, encrypted or decrypted computer data; unavailability of the means or products of the offense, including the assets to be confiscated by the court; interception of electronic communications. With regard to transnational investigations, European Delegated Prosecutors shall act in close cooperation by providing mutual assistance and consulting regularly in transnational cases. If a measure is to be taken in another Member State of the European Delegated Prosecutor investigating the case, this European Delegated Prosecutor shall decide on the adoption of the necessary measure and the award to a European Delegated Prosecutor located in the Member State in which the measure is to be taken. When the European Delegated Prosecutor investigating the case considers the investigation to be completed, it shall submit to the European Supervisory Prosecutor a report containing a summary of the case and a draft decision on the appropriateness of initiating criminal proceedings before a national court or taking into account sending the case to the national authorities, the termination of the case or a simplified criminal investigation procedure.

- a significant fight must be fought against organized crime, especially against heritage, environmental crime and trafficking in firearms. With regard to firearms, they are a key driver for the intensification of the violence of criminal groups and allow them to intimidate their opponents and exercise control over their members and market. With regard to environmental crime, it was found that law enforcement and judicial authorities do not have the capacity and resources to detect, to effectively investigate and prosecute crimes against the environment. Due to the illegal management and transfer of waste that undermines legitimate waste treatment and recycling industries, the revision of the EU Waste Transfer Regulation needs to be revised, and the Environmental Crimes Directive has been revised to clarify the scope of environmental crime. In order to investigate the various transnational offences, it is also necessary to adapt law enforcement and the judiciary to the digital age.

Thus, the search for clues and evidence, including legal access to data transmitted in communications, is the cornerstone of investigations and prosecutions for law enforcement purposes, bringing criminals to justice. Switching tracks and samples from one physical space to another online is a variety of challenges, and some evidence-gathering tools and measures designed on physical evidence are not yet fully adapted to the digital world. To ensure access to this evidence, Member States have established data retention frameworks but timely access to digital evidence is required when held by providers in another jurisdiction. As stated in the Second Additional Protocol to the Budapest Convention on Cybercrime on Enhanced Cooperation and the Disclosure of Electronic Evidence, efforts to digitize law enforcement and the judiciary must be accelerated, all Member States should participate in the digital electronic

evidence exchange system (eEDES). Encryption is also essential for the digital world, as it contributes to securing digital systems and transactions, as well as protecting more fundamental rights.

3. Techniques and methods for identifying and seizure of the proceeds

In order to investigate transnational crime, the necessary measures should be taken within each national legal system to enable supervised deliveries to be used properly and, where appropriate, to other special investigation techniques, such as electronic surveillance or other forms of surveillance and infiltration operations, by its competent authorities in its territory in order to effectively combat organized crime.

In addition to the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, there are other international documents defining good practices in the use of special investigative techniques and we could recall here:

- Council of Europe Convention on Capital Laundering, Detection, Seizure and Confiscation of the proceeds of crime and the financing of terrorism;
- The Council of Europe Convention on Cybercrime provides for dynamic and rapid cooperation between States Parties to investigate cybercrime;
- Council of Europe Convention on Trafficking in Human Beings - Expert Group on Actions against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA) - regularly emphasizes the importance of using special investigative techniques for comply with the obligation to conduct investigations in the appropriate form relating to trafficking in human beings.

There are European countries that do not have an appropriate legal framework to regulate these special techniques or lack coherence in the obligations imposed on internet access providers regarding storage data and access to it by repressive services. There must be sufficient training programs in the application of special investigative techniques for those who are part of the repressive bodies, prosecutors and judges, there must be a legal order in the collection of information (preventive information) and the activities intended for the means of proof necessary for the collection of evidence in order to initiate criminal proceedings in criminal proceedings, the conditions for authorization to use special investigative techniques, the issue of the protection of witnesses and persons collaborating with the judiciary. Regarding the latter aspect, the testimony of co-defendants is often decisive in cases related to transnational organized crime. For this reason to discover and investigate transnational organizations and to thwart planned operations, the cooperation of persons who have participated directly or indirectly in criminal acts and who may be covered by the criminal prosecution (collaborators of justice) must be sufficiently encouraged.

In order to combat transnational organized crime, active cooperation and exchange of information between administrative services and private entities and repressive authorities, including at transnational level, must also be promoted, in an appropriate legal framework, guaranteeing data protection and the right to privacy. In order to create these administrative synergies at international level, issues related to the language obstacle, the deadlines inherent in transnational communications, must be overcome, diversity of legal requirements (certain procedures may be required in one country but not in another), ignorance of national systems (for example to which authorities the request is addressed, without the help of liaison agents or contact points).

In different countries of the European Union there is the institution of confiscation as well as seizure leading to the blocking of assets and the subsequent recovery of the proceeds of crime. To this end, there is a proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council on the recovery and confiscation of assets- 2022/0167, 22.05.2022 which states that minimum rules on the pursuit and identification, unavailability, confiscation and management of property in criminal proceedings are established. In this respect, the proposal for a directive shows the ways in which the dismissal and confiscation are made, and as regards confiscation it may be extended, applied to third parties, to the confiscation of unjustified assets related to the commission of criminal activities. Provisions on asset management and pre-confiscation planning, sale as a provisional measure, asset management offices are also shown.

The special investigative techniques are one of the five key areas alongside witness protection, cooperation with the private sector, recovery of assets, enhancing international cooperation and
the widening of networks, as identified in the White Paper\textsuperscript{14} on transnational\textsuperscript{15} organized crime\textsuperscript{16},
adopted by the Council of Europe in 2014, which includes a list of recommendations aimed at defining which measures should be applied.

The legal provisions concerning the transnational organized crime provides answers to the question of what needs to be done, but it is equally important to provide answers on how transnational organized crime can be effectively investigated and which would be the most suitable techniques and methods for identifying and seizure of the proceeds.

Without pretending to be exhaustive, the investigation of this type of criminality requires the use of evidentiary procedures in order to administer the evidences. Traditional methods of investigation are often inadequate because of the special structures and professionalism of transnational organized criminal groups. The special investigative techniques are therefore applied to penetrate such criminal groups. The use of special investigative techniques must take place in the context of achieving a balance between the interests of a criminal investigation and the protection of human rights, mainly the right to privacy, in order to prevent the abuse.

First of all, the investigation of transnational organized crime cannot be carried out without the use of surveillance or special investigative techniques.

As regulated in most criminal procedure codes the following are surveillance or special investigative techniques:

\begin{itemize}
  \item[a)] wiretapping of communications or of any type of remote communication\textsuperscript{17};
  \item[b)] accessing a computer system\textsuperscript{18};
  \item[c)] video, audio or photo surveillance\textsuperscript{19};
  \item[d)] tracking or tracing with the use of technical devices\textsuperscript{20};
  \item[e)] obtaining data regarding the financial transactions of individuals\textsuperscript{21};
  \item[f)] withholding, delivery or search of mail deliveries\textsuperscript{22};
  \item[g)] use of undercover investigators and informants\textsuperscript{23};
  \item[h)] authorized participation in specific activities\textsuperscript{24};
\end{itemize}

\textsuperscript{14} https://edoc.coe.int/en/organised-crime/6837-white-paper-on-transnational-organised-crime.html
\textsuperscript{15} United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (UNTOC) Article 3: “(a) It is committed in more than one State; (b) It is committed in one State but a substantial part of its preparation, planning, direction or control takes place in another State; (c) It is committed in one State but involves an organized criminal group that engages in criminal activities in more than one State; or (d) It is committed in one State but has substantial effects in another State.”

\textsuperscript{16} Appendix to Council of Europe Recommendation concerning guiding principles on the fight against organized crime (2001): “organized crime group shall mean a structured group of three or more persons, existing for a period of time and acting in concert with the aim of committing one or more serious crimes, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or material benefit”.

\textsuperscript{17} Wiretapping of communications or of any type of messages designates the wiretapping, accessing, monitoring, collection or recording of communications via phone, computer system or any other communication device.

\textsuperscript{18} Accessing a computer system designates the penetration of a computer system or of other data storage device either directly or from a distance, through specialized programs or through a network, for the purpose of identifying evidence. A computer system is any device or combination of devices interconnected between them or in a functional relationship, one or more of which provide the automatic data processing by means of a computer program. Computer data is any representation of facts, information or concepts in a form appropriated for processing in a computer system, including a program able to determine the performance of a function by a computer system.

\textsuperscript{19} Video, audio or photo surveillance is the taking of pictures of persons, the observation or recording of their conversations, gestures or other activities.

\textsuperscript{20} Tracking or tracing with the use of technical devices is the use of devices that establish the location of the person or the object to which such devices are attached.

\textsuperscript{21} Obtaining of data regarding the financial transactions of individuals designates operations that provide knowledge of the contents of financial transactions and other operations performed or to be performed through a credit institution or through other financial entity, as well as the obtaining from a credit institution or other financial entities of documents or information held by it referring to the transactions or operations of a person.

\textsuperscript{22} Search of mail deliveries designates the inspection, through physical or technical methods, of letters or other mail deliveries or objects transmitted through any other means.

\textsuperscript{23} Use of undercover investigators and informants designates the use of a person with an identity other than their real one, for the purpose of obtaining data and information regarding the commission of an offence.

\textsuperscript{24} Authorized participation in specific activities means the commission of acts similar to the objective component of a corruption offense, the performance of transactions, operations or any other kind of arrangements related to an asset or to a person who is presumed missing, a victim of trafficking in human beings or of kidnapping, the performance of operations...
i) controlled delivery;  

j) obtaining data generated or processed by providers of public electronic communication networks or by providers of electronic communication services intended for the public, other than the content of communications, stored by these under the special law on storing data generated or processed by providers of public electronic communication networks and by providers of electronic communication services intended for the public.

As the relevant judicial practice demonstrates, the use of home searches and at the headquarters of legal entities, as well as computer searches is successful. The specificity of the cross-border organized crime investigation is the simultaneity of conducting searches in order to destroy the entire organized criminal group. A large number of house searches are being carried out in the same day in several locations in the same country and in several locations in others countries.

The success of the searches consists in cooperation between different law enforcement agencies (the Economic Crime Investigation Directorate and subordinate territorial structures, the Special Operations Directorate, Service for Combatting Computer Crime, the Institute of Forensics, the Gendarmerie) because the searches carried out with the support of police officers from several law enforcement agencies.

The combating transnational organized crime not only involves prosecuting the offenders, but depriving them of the proceeds of offence. Usually, the illegal proceeds are subsequently laundered. To this end, timely tracing of assets in different jurisdictions, effective coordination at a transnational level and direct contact among asset recovery bodies is essential. The seizure and freezing of assets in a transnational setting is necessary to be effective, and mechanisms to speed up cooperation at this level need to be further explored and implemented.

In many cases, the assets of organized criminal groups are held in the name of other persons, especially relatives or friends. Businesses are usually run by front individuals without a criminal interest. In such cases, the judge must have the authority to dispose the confiscation of the money, commodities or any other assets, if the value of the goods and properties are disproportionate to the statement of income or the business activity performed.

Involving drugs, as well as the providing of services, based on an authorization from the judicial bodies of competent jurisdiction for the purpose of obtaining evidence.

25 Controlled delivery designates a surveillance and investigation technique allowing for the entry, transit or exit from the territory of the country of goods in respect of which there is a suspicion related to the illicit nature of their possession or obtaining, under the surveillance of or based on an authorization from the competent authorities, for the purpose of investigating an offense or of identifying the persons involved in its commission.

26 For example, forty house searches as part of an ongoing investigation led by the European Public Prosecutor’s Office (EPPO) on 16 May 2023 into suspected fraud involving EU and national funds, amounting to more than €30 million, in Romania and in France. At stake is a suspected criminal scheme to provide false letters of guarantee to awardees of projects financed by EU funds, which claimed to insure the projects against potential damages. In the framework of several projects benefitting from EU funding, several letters of guarantee were issued by fictitious banks or dubious financial entities that did not have the necessary cash to cover the insured damages. The suspected perpetrators are believed to have issued letters of guarantee in the name of fictitious financial entities or with fictitious financial resources. In exchange for issuing the letters of guarantee, the suspects are understood to have collected large sums of money, which they used for their own interests.

27 In a VAT fraud scheme involving several countries (Italy, Austria, Belgium, Bulgaria, Czechia, Germany, Latvia, Lithuania, the Netherlands, Poland, Slovakia, Slovenia and Spain), at the request of the EPPO, the judge for preliminary investigations of the Court of Padua ordered the freezing of assets of more than €28 million, in order to recover the damage to the national and EU budgets. The shares of a company belonging to the suspected ringleader, as well as real estate located in a historic building in the center of Bologna, were seized. The association, operating as a criminal group, purchased electronic products abroad, using a series of fictitious companies based in Italy and in the European Union, in order to evade the payment of VAT. The sales of technological and IT products at a much lower price than that charged by honest businesses (in some cases, with discounts of up to 50%) also increased the illicit profits.

VAT carousel fraud, or Missing Trader Intra-Community (MTIC) fraud, is the most profitable crime in the EU, costing around €50 billion annually in tax losses to the Member States, according to the latest estimate by Europol.

28 In a Europe-wide VAT fraud concerning the sale of second-hand vehicles, during the searches of the suspects’ homes in Paris (France), three Porsches were seized, as well as cash, several Rolex watches, jewellery and luxury handbags, worth a total of more than €775 000. Bank accounts in Romania were frozen simultaneously. The three suspects were indicted by a European Delegated Prosecutor on charges of money laundering by organised crime and forgery.
4. Cooperation between EU bodies and agencies to combat transnational crime
Organized crime is a significant threat to citizens, European state institutions, and to the economy as a whole. Organized crime has been found to be characterized by an interconnected environment in which cooperation between criminals is fluid, systematic and profit-oriented. Thus there must be cooperation between bodies and institutions operating internationally and we would like to mention here Interpol, Europol, Eurojust, the Schengen Information System (SIS), creation of an EU Code of Police Cooperation, use of the European Multidisciplinary Platform against Criminal Threats (EMPACT).
We believe that judicial and police cooperation, the use of special investigative techniques, the proper functioning of witness protection programs, collaborators and the recovery of assets need to be improved.